

## Many different disk knots with the same exterior

L. R. HITT<sup>(1)</sup> and D. W. SUMNERS

### §1. Introduction

Much of codimension-two knot theory is concerned with finding and computing topological invariants of knot exteriors in order to distinguish between the knots themselves. It is well-known ([G], [L-S], [B]) that there are at most two inequivalent smooth  $n$ -sphere knots with the same exterior ( $n \geq 2$ ), and examples of two inequivalent  $n$ -knots with the same exterior have recently been discovered ([C-S], [Go]). We show that the corresponding theory for  $(n+1)$ -disk knots is more complicated. Let  $Y$  denote the bounded exterior of a smooth  $(n+1)$ -disk knot. The *indeterminacy index*  $\zeta(Y)$  is the number of inequivalent  $(n+1)$ -disk pairs having exteriors diffeomorphic to  $Y$ . We show that there exist disk knots with large indeterminacy indices (bigger than two, in particular). We then show that  $\zeta(Y) \leq 2|\pi'|$ , where  $|\pi'|$  denotes the cardinality of  $\pi'$ , the commutator subgroup of  $\pi = \pi_1(\partial Y)$ . This yields as a corollary a new and easy proof of the well-known fact that  $\zeta(X) \leq 2$ , where  $X$  is the exterior of an  $n$ -sphere knot, and  $\zeta(X)$  its indeterminacy index.

### §2. The indeterminacy index

For convenience, we work in the smooth category (the same results hold in the locally flat PL situation). We let  $S^n$  and  $D^{n+1}$  denote the standard  $n$ -sphere and  $(n+1)$ -disk, respectively. An  *$n$ -sphere knot* (or just  *$n$ -knot*) is the pair  $(S^{n+2}, kS^n)$  where  $k: S^n \rightarrow S^{n+2}$  is an embedding. The *exterior*  $X$  of an  $n$ -knot is the complement in  $S^{n+2}$  of an open trivial 2-disk bundle neighborhood of the submanifold  $kS^n$ . An  *$(n+1)$ -disk knot* is the pair  $(D^{n+3}, gD^{n+1})$  where  $g: D^{n+1} \rightarrow D^{n+3}$  denotes a proper embedding, one in which the submanifold  $gD^{n+1}$  intersects  $\partial D^{n+3}$  transversely in  $g(\partial D^{n+1})$ . We let  $Y$  denote the  $(n+1)$ -disk knot exterior. Two knots are *equivalent* if there is a diffeomorphism of the ambient space throwing one submanifold onto the other (we disregard orienta-

---

<sup>1</sup> Research partially supported by the University of South Alabama Research Committee.

tions), and the *indeterminacy index*  $\zeta$  is the number of inequivalent knots determined by a given knot exterior.

We will now produce examples to show that  $\zeta(Y)$  can be large. The reason for this is that  $\partial Y$  contains the exterior  $X$  of the boundary sphere pair, and  $X$  can be very complicated. Recall the example of Kato [Ka 2, Theorem 4.9]:

Let  $n \geq 3$ , and  $M^{n+2}$  be a contractible manifold such that  $\pi_1(\partial M)$  is the binary icosohedral group  $G = \langle a, b \mid a^5 = b^3 = (ab)^2 \rangle$  [Ke]. Let  $Y^{n+3} = S^1 \times M^{n+2}$ ; we will show that  $Y$  is the exterior of at least three inequivalent  $(n + 1)$ -disk knots. Then by modifying the construction, we will show that the indeterminacy index of a disk knot exterior can be at least as large as six.

Let  $H$  be a group. A *weight element* of  $H$  is an element whose normal closure is all of  $H$ . The *automorphism class* of an element of  $H$  is the orbit of the element under the automorphism group of  $H$ . Two elements of  $H$  are *algebraically distinct* if they are in different automorphism classes.

We are interested in finding different automorphism classes of weight elements in the group  $\pi_1(\partial Y) \cong Z \times G \cong \langle t, a, b \mid a^5 = b^3 = (ab)^2, ta = at, tb = bt \rangle$  where  $Z$  denotes the infinite cyclic group generated by  $t$ . An element of the form  $t^n g$ , for  $g \in G$ , is a weight element of  $Z \times G$  if and only if  $t^n$  is a weight element of  $Z$  and  $g$  is a weight element of  $G$ , which forces  $n = \pm 1$ . To determine the weight elements of  $G$ , note that  $\{1\} \triangleleft \{1, (ab)^2\} \triangleleft G$  is a composition series for  $G$ , since  $\langle a, b \mid a^5 = b^3 = (ab)^2 = 1 \rangle$  is a presentation of the simple group  $A_5$ . The center of  $G$  is  $C(G) = \{1, (ab)^2\}$ , the cyclic group of order 2. Any element of  $G$  which is not in  $C(G)$  is a weight element of  $G$ . The set of algebraically distinct weight elements of  $G$  is  $\{a, a^2, b, b^2, ab\}$ . That they are algebraically distinct follows from their different orders: 10, 5, 6, 3 and 4, respectively.

Therefore we have  $ta, ta^2, tb, tb^2$ , and  $tab$  as weight elements of  $Z \times G$ . However  $ta$  and  $ta^2$  are in the same automorphism class in  $Z \times G$ , as are  $tb$  and  $tb^2$  (e.g., the automorphism  $\theta$ , induced by  $\theta(t) = t(ab)^2$ ,  $\theta(a) = a^7$ , and  $\theta(b) = ba^8b$  sends  $ta$  to  $ta^2$ ). So our list of possibly algebraically distinct weight elements is shortened to  $ta, tb$ , and  $tab$ . That these three elements are algebraically distinct follows from the fact that the center of  $Z \times G$  is  $Z \times \{1, (ab)^2\}$ , so  $Z \times G$  modulo its center is  $A_5 \cong \langle a, b \mid a^5 = b^3 = (ab)^2 = 1 \rangle$ . But the center is a characteristic subgroup, so any automorphism of  $Z \times G$  induces one on  $A_5$ . Since  $a, b$ , and  $ab$  have different orders in  $A_5$ , their counterparts in  $Z \times G$  must be algebraically distinct.

Let  $\{\sigma_i \mid 1 \leq i \leq 3\}$  denote smooth embeddings of  $S^1$  in  $\partial Y$  representing the homotopy class in  $\partial Y$  of each of the above weight elements of  $Z \times G$ . Choose a trivialization of the normal bundle of each  $\sigma_i$ , and attach 2-handles to form the manifolds  $Y \cup_{\sigma_i} h^2$ . The cocore or transverse disk of each 2-handle is an  $(n + 1)$ -disk, and  $(Y \cup_{\sigma_i} h^2, \text{cocore}(h^2)) \approx (D^{n+3}, g_i d^{n+1})$ , where  $g_i : D^{n+1} \rightarrow D^{n+3}$  is a

proper smooth embedding. This is because  $Y \cup_{\alpha_i} h^2$  is contractible, with simply-connected boundary, and  $n + 3 \geq 6$ . However, no two of the three disk pairs  $(Y \cup_{\alpha_i} h^2, g_i D^{n+1})$  are equivalent, because any diffeomorphism of pairs between them would restrict to a diffeomorphism on  $Y$ , inducing an isomorphism on  $\pi_1(\partial Y)$  taking one of the weight elements of  $Z \times G$  to another, or its inverse.

In [S], it is shown that  $(n + 1)$ -disk pairs ( $n \geq 2$ ) can be constructed with an arbitrarily prescribed Alexander polynomial in a single dimension  $p$  ( $2 \leq p \leq n$ ), and trivial Alexander polynomials elsewhere. Moreover, these disk pairs have the property that  $\pi_1(Y) \cong \pi_i(\partial Y) \cong \pi_i(S^1)$  for  $i < p$ . Thus, by taking the boundary connected sum of the above examples with these disk pairs, one obtains infinitely many distinct  $(n + 1)$ -disk exteriors, each with indeterminacy index  $\zeta \geq 3$ . This proves

**THEOREM 2.1.** *For each  $n \geq 3$ , there exist infinitely many homeomorphically distinct  $(n + 1)$ -disk knot exteriors  $Y_i$ , each with indeterminacy index  $\zeta(Y_i) \geq 3$ .*

*Remark.* The analogue of Theorem 2.1 for  $n = 2$  can be done in the topological category (non-PL embeddings). One takes  $Y = S^1 \times (c * \Sigma^3)$ , where  $c * \Sigma^3$  is the cone on  $\Sigma^3$ , the Poincaré' 3-sphere. Then  $Y$  is a topological manifold [Ca], and arguments of Scharlemann [Sc] can be used to prove that the various handle attachments give rise to different non-PL disk pairs  $(D^5, gD^3)$ .

We can modify the above construction to increase the lower bound for the indeterminacy index. Consider the group

$$G \times G \times G = \langle a, b, c, d, e, f \mid a^5 = b^3 = (ab)^2, c^5 = d^3 = (cd)^2, e^5 = f^3 = (ef)^2, \\ ac = ca, ad = da, bc = cb, bd = db, ae = ea, af = fa, be = eb, bf = fb, \\ ce = ec, cf = fc, de = ed, df = fd \rangle.$$

Now  $G \times G \times G$  is finitely presented, and  $H_1(G \times G \times G) = H_2(G \times G \times G) = 0$ , so by Kervaire [Ke], for  $n \geq 4$  there exists a contractible manifold  $M^{n+2}$  with  $\pi_1(\partial M) \cong G \times G \times G$ . As before,  $Y = S^1 \times M$ , and  $\pi_1(\partial Y) \cong Z \times G \times G \times G$ . Since the center of  $Z \times G \times G \times G$  is the product of the center of each factor, we see that  $Z \times G \times G \times G$  modulo its center is  $A_5 \times A_5 \times A_5$ . Then, as before, *tacf*, *tacef*, *tbdef*, *tace*, *tbd*, and *tabcdef* are all algebraically distinct since their projections modulo the center have orders 15, 10, 6, 5, 3, and 2, respectively. We have the following

**COROLLARY 2.2.** *For each  $n \geq 4$ , there exist infinitely many homeomorphically distinct  $(n + 1)$ -disk knot exteriors  $Y_i$ , each with indeterminacy index  $\zeta(Y_i) \geq 6$ .*

**§3. An upper bound for the indeterminacy index**

Now that we have seen that in some cases the lower bound of  $\zeta$  can be large, we are interested in finding upper bounds. Along these lines, we have the following

**THEOREM 3.1.** *Let  $Y^{n+3}$  be an  $(n+1)$ -disk knot exterior ( $n \geq 2$ ). Then  $\zeta(Y) \leq 2|\pi'|$ , where  $|\pi'|$  denotes the cardinality of the commutator subgroup  $\pi'$  of  $\pi = \pi_1(\partial Y)$ .*

*Proof.* Consider the disk pair  $(D^{n+3}, gD^{n+1})$ . Choose a trivialization  $G : D^2 \times D^{n+1} \rightarrow N(gD^{n+1})$  of the tubular neighborhood of the submanifold; thus  $G(\{0\} \times y) = g(y)$  for  $y \in D^{n+1}$ . We have that the exterior  $Y = D^{n+3} - G(D^2 \times D^{n+1})$ . Regarding  $N(gD^{n+1})$  as a 2-handle attached to  $Y$  via the meridian attaching curve  $G(\partial D^2 \times \{0\})$ , we have  $(D^{n+3}, gD^{n+1}) \approx (Y \cup_G h^2, \text{cocore}(h^2))$ . We now wish to study the number of different ways it is possible to attach a 2-handle to  $Y$  to produce  $D^{n+3}$ . We first count the maximum number of possible isotopy classes in  $\partial Y$  of attaching curves for a 2-handle which produce a contractible manifold after handle attachment is performed. If  $\pi = \pi_1(\partial Y)$ , and  $\pi'$  is the commutator subgroup of  $\pi$ , we have the short exact sequence

$$1 \rightarrow \pi' \rightarrow \pi \rightarrow Z \rightarrow 1. \tag{3.2}$$

Denoting the generator of the infinite cyclic multiplicative group by  $t$ , we have a semi-direct product structure for  $\pi$ , and once a splitting for (3.2) is chosen, we can write each element  $x \in \pi$  uniquely as  $x = t^a g$  where  $a$  is an integer and  $g \in \pi'$ . By abuse of notation, let  $t^a g$  represent an embedding of  $S^1$  in the same homotopy class, and choose a trivialization of its normal bundle. In order for  $Y \cup_{t^a g} h^2$  to be acyclic, we must have  $a = \pm 1$ , because  $H_1(Y; Z)$  is infinite cyclic on the generator  $t$ . In order for  $Y \cup_{t^a g} h^2$  to be contractible,  $i_*(t^a g)$  must be a weight element of  $\pi_1(Y)$ , where  $i_* : \pi_1(\partial Y) \rightarrow \pi_1(Y)$  is the inclusion homomorphism. In order for  $\partial(Y \cup_{t^a g} h^2)$  to be simply-connected,  $t^a g$  must be a weight element of  $\pi_1(\partial Y)$ . The upper bound we are aiming at is very crude, coming just from the homology condition ( $a = \pm 1$ ), so we are in fact counting the ways it is possible to complete  $Y$  to obtain an integral homology disk. The set of elements of  $\pi_1(\partial Y)$  producing acyclic manifolds upon handle attachment is  $\{t^{\pm 1} g \mid g \in \pi'\}$ . But since the sign of the exponent of  $t$  in an element of  $\pi_1(\partial Y)$  is reversed by changing the orientation of the attaching curve of  $h^2$  (or equivalently, reversing the orientation on the cocore  $D^{n+1}$ ), the set of elements of  $\pi$  corresponding to possibly different manifold pairs is  $\{tg \mid g \in \pi'\}$ , a set of the cardinality of  $\pi'$ . Now since we are in the

dimension range  $(n + 2) \geq 4$  for  $\partial Y$ , homotopy of embedded one-spheres gives rise to isotopy, so the number of possible isotopy classes of attaching curves in  $\partial Y$  giving rise to acyclic manifolds is bounded above by  $|\pi'|$ . Now, given a representative of an isotopy class of attaching curves in  $\partial Y$ , there are precisely two ways to attach the 2-handle  $h^2$ , corresponding to the  $\pi_1(SO) = \mathbb{Z}_2$  ways of choosing a trivialization of the normal bundle of the curve. Hence the number of possible handle attachments yielding acyclic manifolds is bounded above by  $2|\pi'|$ .

**COROLLARY 3.3.** *Suppose that  $Y^{n+3}$  ( $n \geq 2$ ) is an  $(n + 1)$ -disk knot exterior, and that  $\pi_1(\partial Y) = \mathbb{Z}$ . Then  $\zeta(Y) \leq 2$ , and the two possibly different disk pairs are obtained, each from the other, by re-attaching the 2-handle corresponding to the normal bundle over the submanifold via the non-trivial element of  $\pi_1(SO)$ .*

Corollary 3.3 yields an easy proof of the well-known result that there are at most two inequivalent  $n$ -knots with the same exterior:

**COROLLARY 3.4.** ([B], [L-S], [Ka 1], [Sw]). *Let  $X^{n+2}$  ( $n \geq 3$ ) be an  $n$ -sphere exterior. Then  $\zeta(X) \leq 2$ . Moreover, if  $(X \cup_\gamma (D^2 \times S^n), \{0\} \times S^n)$  denotes a sphere pair obtained by sewing  $D^2 \times S^n$  onto  $X$  via some trivialization of the  $S^n$ -bundle over the meridian curve  $\gamma = S^1 \times \{*\} \subset \partial X$ , then the possibly different sphere pair is  $(X \cup_{\bar{\gamma}} (D^2 \times S^n), \{0\} \times S^n)$ , where  $\bar{\gamma}$  denotes the same meridian curve with different trivialization of the  $S^n$ -bundle (i.e.,  $D^2 \times S^n$  is sewn in with a  $\pi_1(SO)$ -twist).*

*Proof.* There is a one-to-one correspondence between  $n$ -sphere knots and  $n$ -disk knots with unknotted boundary  $(n - 1)$ -sphere pair, obtained by removing an unknotted disk pair (the neighborhood of a point on the submanifold) from the sphere pair to obtain the required disk pair. An  $n$ -sphere knot and its corresponding  $n$ -disk knot have the same exterior  $X$ . But  $\partial X \approx S^1 \times S^n$ , and  $\pi_1(\partial X) = \mathbb{Z}$ , so by Corollary 2.4,  $\zeta(X) \leq 2$ . That is,  $X$  (thought of as a disk exterior) determines at most two inequivalent disk pairs. Therefore, thinking of it as a sphere pair exterior, then  $\zeta(X) \leq 2$  as well.

**§4. Some questions**

1. Given a positive integer  $N$ , does there exist an  $(n + 1)$ -disk exterior  $Y$  with  $\zeta(Y) \geq N$ ?
2. Is there an  $(n + 1)$ -disk exterior  $Y$  with  $\zeta(Y) = +\infty$ ?
3. If  $X$  is an  $n$ -sphere exterior and  $\pi_1(X) = \mathbb{Z}$ , must it follow that  $\zeta(X) = 1$ ?

## REFERENCES

- [B] W. BROWDER, *Diffeomorphisms of 1-connected manifolds*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 128 (1967), 155–163.
- [Ca] J. W. CANNON, *Shrinking cell-like decompositions of manifolds: codimension three*, Ann. of Math. 110 (1979), 83–112.
- [C-S] S. CAPELL and J. L. SHANESON, *There exist inequivalent knots with the same complement*, Ann. of Math. 103 (1976), 349–353.
- [G] H. GLUCK, *The embedding of two-spheres in the four-sphere*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 104 (1962), 308–333.
- [Go] C. M. GORDON, *Knots in the 4-sphere*, Comment. Math. Helv. 51 (1976), 585–596.
- [Ka 1] M. KATO, *A concordance classification of PL homeomorphisms of  $S^p \times S^q$* , Topology 8 (1969), 371–383.
- [Ka 2] M. KATO, *Higher dimensional PL knots and knot manifolds*, Jour. Math. Soc. Jap. 21 (1969), 458–480.
- [Ke] M. KERVAIRE, *Smooth homology spheres and their fundamental groups*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 144 (1969), 67–72.
- [L-S] R. K. LASHOF and J. S. SHANESON, *Classification of knots in codimension two*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. 75 (1969), 171–175.
- [Sc] M. SCHARLEMANN, *Stably trivial non-PL knotted ball pairs*, Notices Amer. Math. Soc. 23 (1976), pg. A-22, Abstract #76T-G5.
- [S] D. W. SUMNERS, *Homotopy torsion in codimension two knots*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 24 (1970), 229–240.
- [Sw] G. A. SWARUP, *A note on higher-dimensional knots*, Math. Zeit. 121 (1971), 141–144.

University of South Alabama  
Mobile, Al 36688

Florida State University  
Tallahassee, FL 32306

Received November 22, 1979/November 30, 1980